

STAFF REPORT

Operations Committee, March 1, 2012

Quality Control and Limited Special Inspections Services for Western Wake Regional Water Reclamation Facility (EN12-048)

Consideration of Consultant Selection for Western Wake Regional Water Reclamation Facility Quality Control Services

Speaker: Mr. Tim Bailey

From: Tim Bailey, PE, Engineering Director

Prepared by: Alexandra Jones, PE, Engineer

Approved by: Benjamin T. Shivar, Town Manager

Approved by: Michael J. Bajorek, Assistant Town Manager

Executive Summary

Staff received proposals on December 1, 2011 for Quality Control and Limited Special Inspection Services for the Western Wake Regional Water Reclamation Facility (WWRWRF). Proposals were received from eleven firms before the submittal deadline: A1 Consulting, Building & Earth Sciences, Falcon Engineering, Geotechnologies, Kleinfelder, Mosher Engineering, S&ME, Stewart Engineering, Summit, Terracon, and Trimat Materials Testing Services. The selection committee recommends selecting Geotechnologies for this project.

Discussion

Staff received proposals on December 1, 2011 for Quality Control and Limited Special Inspection Services for the Western Wake Regional Water Reclamation Facility (WWRWRF). The services requested include testing and providing quality control measurements for concrete, soils, asphalt pavement, coatings, steel structures, and masonry structures.

The Town of Cary has exempted this project from the provisions of North Carolina General Statute 143-64.31 as it is in the best interests of its citizens to procure these services through a process of open competition. Therefore, cost proposals were considered in making the final selection.

The RFP indicated that the key factors used to evaluate the proposals would be:

- Firm experience/reputation/workload;
- Experience of personnel assigned to the project team;
- Response to objectives outlined in the RFP; and
- Price proposal.

Proposals were received from eleven firms before the submittal deadline: A1 Consulting, Building & Earth Sciences, Falcon Engineering, Geotechnologies, Kleinfelder, Mosher Engineering, S&ME, Stewart Engineering, Summit, Terracon, and Trimat Materials Testing. A five-member selection committee of Town staff was assembled to review all the proposals and conduct interviews with select firms.

Members of the committee have previous experience with many of the firms and personnel proposed to be responsible for the work. The committee placed a high value on the firm's and personnel's past experience on projects of similar magnitude as well as the personnel's background and experience.

The cost proposal for the scope of services provided was also considered. The cost proposals provided by the 11 firms varied widely, and are listed below:

<u>Firm name</u>	<u>Total cost proposal</u>
A1 Consulting	\$677,150
Building & Earth Sciences	\$430,175
Falcon Engineering	\$589,831
Geotechnologies	\$525,685
Kleinfelder	\$1,001,460
Mosher Engineering	\$370,910
S&ME	\$995,975
Stewart Engineering	\$616,285
Summit	\$188,494
Terracon	\$399,800
Trimat Materials Testing	\$360,580

With the wide variety in pricing, it was difficult to do a direct comparison of the price proposals. Some firms did not follow instructions for pricing the work as requested by the RFP, and appeared to have either grossly under-priced or over-priced the work. However, the RFP also requested that the firms provide unit prices for their services, and staff was able to evaluate the total cost in terms of number of tests and work hours assumed for the project versus the unit prices for this work.

The selection committee reached consensus in its deliberations that the S&ME and Geotechnologies proposals demonstrated a more complete understanding of the aspects of the project most important to the committee, and these two firms were invited to a follow up interview. The interview provided an opportunity for the selection committee to ask more detailed questions about the material the firms provided in their response to the RFP. The committee used observations from these interviews along with the overall proposal and committee members' past experience with each of the firms to make a final evaluation. Cost was also considered in the evaluation.

The Town of Cary has had very good past experience with both Geotechnologies and S&ME. Geotechnologies has previous experience working on the WWRWRF project; they provided geotechnical testing and evaluation during the design phase and are currently providing construction quality control services for the project on an interim basis through their on-call services contract with the Town of Cary. Geotechnologies was also able to provide a more detailed and more cost-effective price proposal due to the benefit of their past experience on similar wastewater treatment projects. After extensive consideration and discussion, the selection committee reached a consensus to recommend awarding the contract to Geotechnologies.

Timely selection of the consultant is needed to provide services for the Western Wake Regional Water Reclamation Facility Contract 1, which is currently under construction. Separate approval from the Towns of Apex and Morrisville is not needed per the Western Wake Partners Interlocal Agreement, but the Policy Advisory Committee (PAC) considered the consultant selection on February 22, 2012. Before award of contracts, the PAC advises the Lead Agency on selection of outside consultants and contractors.

Fiscal Impact

A total of \$151,742,900 has been appropriated to-date to the Western Wake Regional Water Reclamation Facility, Project SW1123 by the Western Wake Partners (Town of Cary share of appropriations to-date is \$99,501,509). A total of \$92,878,762 has been encumbered/expended to-date; the remaining balance of \$58,864,138 is adequate to cover the proposed price of \$525,685 and any value-added services which may be added during construction of the WWRWRF.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that Council approve the selection committee's recommendation to negotiate an engineering services contract with Goetechnologies for Quality Control and Limited Special Inspection Services for the Western Wake Regional Water Reclamation Facility, with an option for staff to authorize additional value-added services during construction at a later date as a contract amendment. This award represents a preliminary determination as to the qualifications of this consulting firm and no legally binding acceptance of this award occurs until the Town of Cary has executed a written agreement.